

Date: 08 Jan 2024
To: "Utari Vipriyanti" mangtiutari@yahoo.com
From: "GeoJournal (GEJO)" roopika.dhayanithy@springer.com
Subject: Your Submission GEJO-D-23-00899R1

Dear Mrs Vipriyanti,

We have received the reports from our advisors on your manuscript, "LAND-USE PROBLEM AND CONTROLLING FOR SUSTAINABLE COASTAL DEVELOPMENT IN SOUTH BALI", submitted to GeoJournal

Based on the advice received, I have decided that your manuscript can be accepted for publication after you have carried out the corrections as suggested by the reviewer(s).

I agree with the reviewer that the paper should stress the political economy of coastal development more. Your literature review is rather weak. Have the paper edited by a fluent English speaker.

Attached, please find the reviewers' comments for your perusal.

You are kindly requested to also check the website for possible reviewer attachments.

Please submit your revised manuscript online by using the journal's website.

Your username is: *****

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/gejo/>.

Please make sure to submit your editable source files (i. e. Word, TeX).

I am looking forward to receiving your revised manuscript before 22 Jan 2024.

With kind regards,

Barney Warf
Editor in Chief
GeoJournal

COMMENTS TO THE AUTHOR:

Reviewer #1: My general recommendation for this manuscript: the content is definitely important enough to warrant publication. The issue of spatial planning and implementation discrepancies is a significant one, illustrated by the unremediated violations revealed by overlay of GIS data on spatial planning maps for this case study. In general, the conclusions are supported by the evidence.

My two reservations which I believe should be addressed before publication concern the following:

1) The relative under-emphasis on the political economy and legal dimensions of the failures in implementation and law enforcement identified. Indeed, the spatial plans themselves have already been developed under the heavy political influence of a developmentalist set of government priorities and vested economic interests that have already compromised important cultural and environmental values in Bali. Reference to some of the

literature on the political economy of overdevelopment would be appropriate. This is perhaps a matter of disciplinary emphasis and could be dealt with for the purposes of this publication by indicating the need for further research focused on these dimensions and/or some further consideration of the critical literature in these fields.

2) The need for careful editing by a native English speaker with knowledge of the field. Decision to publish should require further work on the expression and wording of the article. Some specific examples that need correction or revised wording include:

p1 Abstract - the term 'mismatch' is insufficient to cover the broad range of impacts of the violations of basic regulations for coastal development - 'significant discrepancy' or some other phrasing would strengthen the argument.

p2 line 21 - Similarly, 'useful' is not strong enough to convey the importance of incentive and disincentive mechanisms for land use control - 'critical' would be more appropriate to the argument of the paper.

p2 line 47 what is meant by 'the physical settlement (fake)'? The meaning of this sentence is not at all clear.

p3 line 46 'this beach'. It is not clear what beach is being referred to until 'Lebih Beach' is mentioned at the end of page 5

p6 line 6 the meaning of SWOT and AHP must be spelled out in full the first time used in the text; Also 'analyzes' should be 'analyses'

p.6 Indonesian technical terms relevant to implementation of spatial planning regulations should be included for clarity. For example, does Beach Border Space (p.6 Fig 2) refer to 'sempadan pantai'? This is important for government regulators who need to be aware of precise categories where discrepancies occur, which may be lost in translation.

More of this kind of research needs to be done to remedy the inevitable tendency to over-development of coastal areas globally. It will be important for the authors in future to collaborate with political economists, anthropologists and legal researchers to advance the goals of this important research.

Authors may need to take specific actions to achieve compliance with funder and institutional open access mandates. If your research is supported by a funder that requires immediate open access (e.g. according to Plan S principles) then you should select the gold OA route, and we will direct you to the compliant route where possible. For authors selecting the subscription publication route our standard licensing terms will need to be accepted, including our self-archiving policies. Those standard licensing terms will supersede any other terms that the author or any third party may assert apply to any version of the manuscript.

Find out more about compliance: <https://www.springernature.com/gp/open-research/funding/policy-compliance-faqs>

Did you know Springer Nature Author Services can help you improve your manuscript through services including English language editing, developmental comments, manuscript formatting, figure preparation, translation, and more.

Find out more about how you can take advantage of these services:

<https://authorservices.springernature.com/go/sn/?>

[utm_source=EM&utm_medium=Revision+Email&utm_campaign=SNAS+Referrals+2023&utm_id=ref2023](https://authorservices.springernature.com/go/sn/?utm_source=EM&utm_medium=Revision+Email&utm_campaign=SNAS+Referrals+2023&utm_id=ref2023)

Please note that the use of these tools, or any other service, is not a requirement for publication, nor does it imply or guarantee that editors will accept the article, or even select it for peer review.

This letter contains confidential information, is for your own use, and should not be forwarded to third parties.

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy>. If you no longer wish to receive messages from this journal or you have questions regarding database management, please contact the Publication Office at the link below.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/gejo/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.